

Planning Committee

10.00am, Thursday, 27 February 2014

Grange Conservation Area - Review of Conservation Area Character Appraisal

Item number	8.2
Report number	
Wards	Meadows/Morningside, Southside/Newington

Links

Coalition pledges	P40
Council outcomes	CO19 CO23
Single Outcome Agreement	SO4

Mark Turley

Director of Services for Communities

Contact: Rachel Haworth, Planning Officer

E-mail: rachel.haworth@edinburgh.gov.uk | Tel: 0131 529 4238

Executive summary

Grange Conservation Area - Review of Conservation Area Character Appraisal

Summary

This report seeks approval of the revised Grange Conservation Area Character Appraisal in draft for consultation. This has been developed as the first of a new style of appraisal which will be used as a model for the revision of those for other conservation areas. The content has been updated to reflect changing issues in the area; the community's views and concerns; and to produce a more user-friendly format.

Recommendations

It is recommended that the Committee approves the attached revised Grange Conservation Area Character Appraisal in draft for consultation.

Measures of success

- Completion of a programme of public consultation on the draft appraisal.
- Incorporation of public feedback and production of the finalised Grange appraisal.
- Positive lessons learned for the ongoing review of appraisals.

Financial impact

The work will be undertaken within existing staff resources. There are no immediate financial implications for the Council arising from this report. There may be financial implications arising from recommendations for specific projects such as enhancement schemes, however these will require further approval from the relevant Committee as projects are developed.

Equalities impact

The aim of conservation area status is to preserve and enhance the quality of the area. This has the potential to improve quality of life and support sustainable communities. Consultation processes and venues will ensure accessibility. The review of the format of character appraisals provides an opportunity to make the documents more accessible than at present.

There are no predicted negative impacts on equalities.

Sustainability impact

The impact of this report in relation to the three elements of the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009 Public Bodies Duties have been considered, and the outcomes are summarised below. Relevant Council sustainable development policies have been taken into account and are noted at Background Reading later in this report.

- The proposals in this report will reduce carbon emissions by encouraging the conservation of resources and energy embodied in existing buildings, rather than demolition and reconstruction, major generators of carbon emissions.
- The need to build resilience to climate change impacts is not relevant to the proposals in this report because conservation of the built environment is not considered to be significantly affected, positively or negatively, in this regard.
- The proposals in this report will help achieve a sustainable Edinburgh because the conservation and management of the historic environment contributes directly to sustainability in a number of ways. These include the energy and materials invested in a building, the scope for adaptation and reuse, and the unique quality of historic environments which provide a sense of identity and continuity.

Consultation and engagement

Significant public engagement has been carried out in the Grange to inform the content and emphasis of the draft appraisal. The Grange Association has provided invaluable support and feedback to this process. Students of the University of Edinburgh's Urban Conservation MSc course have also carried out research which has informed the draft document. A working group of officers has assisted with the production of the appraisal. Once approved for public consultation, the draft appraisal will be taken to a broader audience for detailed comment.

Background reading / external references

Report to Planning Committee of 3 October 2013, Review of Conservation Area Character Appraisals.

Grange Conservation Area - Review of Conservation Area Character Appraisal

1. Background

- 1.1 On 3 October 2013, the Planning Committee approved a programme of review of Edinburgh's conservation areas. The Grange was assessed as one of the initial six priority areas and was agreed as the first to be reviewed.

2. Main report

- 2.1 The revised Conservation Area Character Appraisal is intended to reflect changes that have occurred in the Grange since the previous appraisal was published in 1998; to be more tightly focused on the analysis of character and townscape; and targeted at guiding decisions more clearly. Research has focused on the impact of recent development and areas of information which have been omitted or require updating.
- 2.2 Early engagement with the community and others to inform the draft appraisal has consisted of:
- discussions with the Grange Association;
 - an on-line survey;
 - drop-in information session at Newington Library;
 - collaboration with University of Edinburgh Urban Conservation MSc students; and
 - input from officer working group.
- 2.3 These activities produced invaluable information on the community's priorities and current concerns regarding the nature of change and recent development in the area. 80 responses to the survey were received, including 33 in person from visitors who attended the library information session. A summary of the results of the community survey are attached at Appendix 1. The most common areas of comment or concern were on the use of appropriate materials; the impact of development on trees and gardens; the design and scale/density of extensions and new development; and issues relating to boundary treatments.
- 2.4 The draft Grange Conservation Area Character Appraisal attached at Appendix 2 reflects the feedback received during this initial engagement process. For example, greater emphasis has been given to the townscape role of and the need to protect gaps between buildings; the importance of understanding

context and quality in designing interventions; and the use of appropriate boundary treatments.

- 2.5 The officer working group has helped focus attention on how appraisals are used in decision-making and how this could be improved. The academic research carried out by the UoE has broadened the background to the review and filled gaps in our knowledge, such as the character and development of the Astley Ainslie Hospital area.
- 2.6 To better reflect the active role of the appraisal in guiding decisions, a Management section has been introduced which summarises the controls and policies which apply in the area and identifies a series of pressures and sensitivities, with recommendations made to address each type. Opportunities for development or enhancement are identified.
- 2.7 This document is the text-only version of the proposed content. A further aim of the review is to develop a more user-friendly, interactive, on-line format for this and future appraisals. This is currently in development: a sample section of the interactive document showing its proposed appearance and functionality will be tabled at Committee.
- 2.8 The appraisal will be completed in the interactive format and a public consultation carried out during spring 2014. The consultation will consist of information presented on-line with a feedback form; an exhibition; and information events in Newington Library and elsewhere within the Grange if appropriate, with officers on hand to discuss and explain the appraisal.
- 2.9 The consultation information and related events will be promoted by posters in the local area, on Twitter and online. Local and city wide amenity groups, and local Councillors, will also be notified. The Grange Association has kindly offered the services of their local Newsletter, website and email network in promoting the consultation.

3. Recommendations

- 3.1 It is recommended that the Committee approves the attached revised Grange Conservation Area Character Appraisal in draft for consultation.

Mark Turley

Director of Services for Communities

Links

Coalition pledges	P40 Work with Edinburgh World Heritage Trust and other stakeholders to conserve the city's built heritage.
Council outcomes	CO19 Attractive Places and Well Maintained – Edinburgh remains an attractive city through the development of high quality buildings and places and the delivery of high standards and maintenance of infrastructure and public realm. CO23 Well engaged and well informed – Communities and individuals are empowered and supported to improve local outcomes and foster a sense of community.
Single Outcome Agreement	SO4 Edinburgh's communities are safer and have improved physical and social fabric.
Appendices	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Summary of community survey results2. Draft Grange Conservation Area Character Appraisal

Appendix 1

Grange Conservation Area Character Appraisal Design Survey Analysis of results

An on-line SurveyMonkey questionnaire was set up to capture residents' views on a selection of recent developments in the Grange and to encourage comments about the character and appearance of the area. The survey was advertised from 13 November 2013 and can be viewed at www.surveymonkey.com/s/grangeCACAdesign

80 responses were received. Over 90% of respondents completed the evaluation of recent developments section, answering 2 questions about each development with a multiple-choice answer on a five point scale from 'Very well' to 'Very badly'.

Q1 How well do you feel the development has taken account of the special characteristics?

Q2 How well do you feel the development has preserved or enhanced the character or appearance of the area?

The dominant responses for each question were:

Development 1 (South Oswald Rd apartments 1)

Q1 – Very/fairly badly Q2 – Very/fairly badly

Development 2 (Grange Loan garage and attic)

Q1 – Very/fairly well Q2 – Very/fairly well

Development 3 (St Alban's Rd mews/terrace)

Q1 – Very/fairly well Q2 – Neither well nor badly/badly

Development 4 (Mansionhouse Rd side extension)

Q1 – Very/fairly well Q2 – Very/fairly well

Development 5 (South Oswald Rd apartments 2)

Q1 – Very/fairly badly Q2 – Very/fairly badly

Development 6 (Lauder Rd side/rear extensions)

Q1 – No overall trend Q2 – Very/fairly badly

Development 7 (Lauder Loan house)

Q1 – Very/fairly badly Q2 – Very/fairly badly

Development 8 (Blackford Rd house)

Q1 – Very/fairly badly Q2 – No overall trend

In general, the answers to the two questions tallied, ie. If the respondent felt the characteristics had been taken account of, then the development preserved or enhanced the area (or the reverse). In a few cases however no overall positive or negative feeling predominated (eg. the Blackford Road house divided opinion with some strongly positive and others strongly negative). The developments which adopted a broadly traditional design and/or material palette were preferred, while those of more contemporary character were rated poorly.

In the open-text questions, 58% of the respondents provided comments. Within these, the following subjects or areas of concern featured most prominently (in descending order of number of comments):

- Use of materials (19)
- Tree protection and management (12)
- Density of built development (12)
- Encouraging variety and quality of new development as opposed to traditional/pastiche (10)
- Boundary treatments (10)
- Style/design of new development (8)
- Loss of gardens (7)
- Encouraging traditional/pastiche approaches to design of new development (5)
- Driveways/paving (5)
- Roads/traffic (2)
- Enforcement of unauthorised development (1)

Looking at these responses in greater detail, trees were the single biggest area of concern. Loss of trees is related to the perceived issues of amalgamation of buildings through side extension, loss of gardens and provision of excessive areas of hardstanding for parking. Comments regarding the need for succession planning for the replacement of over-mature specimens, appropriate choice of species and enforcement of replacement planting were made.

Comments about the design of new development and use of materials show a much greater concern for quality and consideration of context than any specific design approach or 'style' (interesting, given the broad trends of the evaluation section). A number of comments recognise the need to allow quality contemporary design and allow the evolution of the area. Some drew a distinction between extensions to traditional buildings, which should harmonise with the style of the original, and new-build sites, where a greater freedom of expression would be appropriate. Poor-quality pastiche was criticised as much as poor-quality contemporary examples.

Density and the impact of extensions came high in the list of concerns. This relates to density of building/footprint, rather than specifically density of dwellings or population. Concerns were raised that dwellings are being extended beyond their original capacity, undermining their character and that of their garden setting. Side extensions which bridge between plots, eroding the characteristic townscape gaps between dwellings, were of particular concern.

This issue in turn creates concerns regarding loss of garden ground, trees, grass and landscaping to built form and car parking. These issues appear to relate to the return of villas to single-family use, reversing earlier trends for subdivision. Examples 1 and 5 in the evaluation section (South Oswald Road) raised comments that, regardless of views on detailed design, the height/volume, tenure and character of these flatted blocks created a worrying precedent of increasing density.

Boundary treatments were mentioned both in terms of protecting historic walls and railings but also ensuring that new interventions protect that element of character. New developments are perceived as eroding boundaries by widening vehicle openings, removing pedestrian gates, and replacing visually-permeable railings and gates with opaque examples.

Appendix 2

GRANGE CONSERVATION AREA CHARACTER APPRAISAL

Contents

1. Summary information		2
2. Conservation area character appraisals		3
3. Historical origins and development		4
4. Special characteristics	4.1 Structure	8
	4.2 Key elements	10
	4.3 Astley Ainslie Hospital	13
5. Management	5.1 Legislation, policies and guidance	15
	5.2 Pressures and sensitivities	18
	5.3 Opportunities for development	20
	5.4 Opportunities for planning action	20
	5.5 Opportunities for enhancement	20
6. Sources		22

1. Summary information

Location and boundaries

The Grange Conservation Area is situated approximately one mile to the south of Edinburgh city centre. The conservation area is bounded by Sciennes Road and Strathearn Road to the north, the south suburban railway line and St. Albans Road to the south and Causewayside to the east. The west boundary is less well defined, but is generally marked by the western boundary of the Astley Ainslie Hospital complex, Newbattle Terrace and Whitehouse Loan. The area falls within the Southside/ Newington and Marchmont and Meadows wards. The population of the Grange Conservation Area in 2011 was approximately 4600, in 2100 households.

Dates of designation/amendments

The Grange Conservation Area was designated on 16 September 1983 and was extended on 29 March 1996 to include the whole of the Astley Ainslie Hospital.

Statement of significance

The architectural form and green environment of the Grange are attributable to the picturesque movement and characterised by romantic, revivalist architectural forms that are original and individual in composition. The buildings are complemented by the profusion of mature trees, spacious garden settings, stone boundary walls and green open spaces. A significant level of uniformity is achieved from the use of local building materials, e.g. local grey sandstone in ashlar or coursed rubble with hand carved decoration, Scots slates, timber framed sash and case windows with plate glass.

Acknowledgements

This document has been produced with the assistance of the Grange Association, a volunteer supported charity formed originally in 1974, which aims to support and protect community interests, the environment and local history of the Grange. The objects of the founding group were to promote an interest in the character and quality of life in the area; to encourage a high standard of architecture and town planning and to react to proposals affecting the area's development, to foster public amenity and to provide good relations in the community. The assistance and enthusiasm of the Grange Association have been invaluable in the production of this document.

Students and staff of the University of Edinburgh's Architectural Conservation MSc Programme have also made a valuable contribution to this document through their analysis and observations of the Grange area.

2. Conservation Area Character Appraisals

Purpose of character appraisals – why do we need them?

Conservation area character appraisals are intended to help manage change. They provide an agreed basis of understanding of what makes an area special. This understanding informs and provides the context in which decisions can be made on proposals which may affect that character. An enhanced level of understanding, combined with appropriate management tools, ensures that change and development sustains and respects the qualities and special characteristics of the area.

“When effectively managed, conservation areas can anchor thriving communities, sustain cultural heritage, generate wealth and prosperity and add to quality of life. To realise this potential many of them need to continue to adapt and develop in response to the modern-day needs and aspirations of living and working communities. This means accommodating physical, social and economic change for the better.

Physical change in conservation areas does not necessarily need to replicate its surroundings. The challenge is to ensure that all new development respects, enhances and has a positive impact on the area. Physical and land use change in conservation areas should always be founded on a detailed understanding of the historic and urban design context.” From PAN 71, Conservation Area Management.

How to use this document

The analysis of the Grange’s character and appearance focuses on the features which make the Grange special and distinctive. This is divided into two sections: **4.1 Structure**, which describes and draws conclusions regarding the overall organisation and macro-scale features of the area; and **4.2 Key elements**, which examines the smaller-scale features and details which fit within the structure. The **4.3 Astley Ainslie Hospital** site is treated as a special sub-area with its own separate analysis.

This document is not intended to give prescriptive instructions on what designs or styles will be acceptable in the area. Instead, it can be used to ensure that the design of an alteration or addition is based on an informed interpretation of context. This context should be considered in conjunction with the relevant Local Development Plan policies and planning guidance (see **5. Management** for more detailed references).

3. Historical origins and development

A review of the historical development of the Grange is important in order to understand how the area has evolved in its present form and adopted its essential character.

The Grange was originally known as Sanct Geilies Grange - the grange or farm of St. Giles, in whose honour a church had been built in Edinburgh as early as 854.

Prior to the 17th century, the land now covered by the Grange was largely common grazing, sloping towards Blackford Hill. William Dick, at one time the Lord Provost of Edinburgh, purchased the lands of the Grange in 1631. Two centuries later, his family became the feudal superiors of the Victorian residential development which forms the basis of the Grange Conservation Area.

1825 Feuing Plan

In 1825, Sir Thomas Dick Lauder, made land from the Grange Estate available for development. The Grange Feuing Plan of 1825, which comprised a series of parallel streets between two major roads: Grange Road to the north and Dick Place to the south, remains a core townscape element of the area. Grange Road appears on the Plan as an access road linking the estate with a new road, now Newington Road. Other streets were proposed at right angles to the main east-west axes: Mansionhouse Road, Lauder Road and Cumin Place.

Cousin's 1851 Feuing Plans

The basis of the 1825 plan was respected in David Cousin's subsequent Feuing Plan of 1851, although the regular street pattern was relieved by slightly curving streets, providing a less formal layout and interesting vistas. These included Tantallon Place, St. Catherine's Place and Dalrymple Crescent. Cousin also planned straight streets, but changed the axis very subtly to achieve an ever-changing and interesting townscape. Findhorn Place and Lauder Road are notable examples.

Raeburn's Feuing Plan

From the mid 19th century, increased demand for housing prompted Dick Lauder to commission Robert Reid Raeburn to design further feuing plans in 1858, 1864 and 1877. Under the first two plans, all available land as far south as Grange Loan was to be divided into smaller plots for individual houses set within their own private gardens. Minor variations to this pattern included a series of flatted dwellings with shops at the corners of Hatton Place. These were the only shops in Raeburn's plans. Individual or semi-detached houses in separate gardens remained the norm.

The 1877 Feuing Plan continued the established street pattern as far south as St. Alban's Road, the north side of which became the limit of the Grange. Subsequent building, after 1877, included a terrace of four houses on the south side of Hope Terrace, St. Raphael's in South Oswald Road and Fountainhall Road Church (1897), now the site of Newington Public Library.

Feuing Terms and Conditions

The regulations which were imposed by the Dick Lauder family are still attached to the title deeds of all properties in the Grange. The feuing conditions detailed below illustrate that development in the Grange has always been subject to strict controls:

- all plans and elevations had to be approved in writing by the feu superior on the recommendation of the architect, and no building could commence until authorised;
- the land was to be feued for villas or dwelling houses only;
- uses other than residential were specifically prohibited;
- the height of development was restricted to two storeys and an attic;
- the siting of properties was controlled by stipulating the minimum distance of the house from the street;
- gardens were required to be planted and kept in good order;
- properties had to be enclosed with stone walls, and the walls were not to exceed eight feet in height, except by the consent of the conterminous feuars, and in no case to exceed ten feet high;
- footpaths were to be of high quality paving materials, raised above the bottom of the channel, edged with a hammer dressed kerbstone, and no wider than six feet nine inches;
- properties were to be of a minimum value, for example, at least £500 in 1851;
- a time limit of around four years was imposed on construction;
- Stables were permitted, but only to the rear of properties and not exceeding 20 feet in height;
- the sub-division of villas was regulated by the stipulation that separate entry to upper flats and attics was by an internal stair only; and
 - residents were granted the use of the streets and feuars were prohibited from causing a public nuisance or disturbing their neighbours.

Open spaces

The Astley Ainslie Hospital and Grange Cemetery form the principal open spaces. Grange Cemetery was established in 1847 by the Edinburgh Southern Cemetery Company Ltd. The site was selected for its natural beauty, seclusion, freedom from pollution and close proximity to the city. David Bryce designed and laid out the

Cemetery, which comprised an open space of twelve acres with a mortuary chapel above vaults in the centre of the ground.

Astley Ainslie Hospital

A chapel dedicated to St Roque, patron of plague sufferers, was established in the Canaan area, west of the Grange, in the early 16th century. Plague victims banished from Edinburgh were housed at St. Roque and administered to by religious communities including the monks of the Grange of St Giles. Archaeological remains on the site include four large cylindrical bosses, located at the base of the southern boundary wall of Southbank villa, which possibly formed part of the historic chapel.

The Canaan Estate in which St Roque's chapel lay was created at the feuing of the Burgh Muir in 1586. The collection of Biblical place names around the Canaan area, including Little Egypt, may originate from the site of a gypsy camp; the term gypsy being a corruption of Egyptian, based on a misunderstanding of their origins.

The estate was used for farming and related industries up until 1803, when the area between Grange Loan and Canaan Lane was feued out into large (c.3 acre) plots for residential development. Small country mansions or villas with private, walled grounds and extensive gardens were developed by a group of intellectuals, university professors and medical practitioners. The development of the Canaan Estate therefore prefaces the development of the main area of the Grange through the Dick Lauder and subsequent plans by 20-30 years. The current use of the site as a medical and educational establishment maintains the connection with the professions and interests of the first feuars.

By the early 20th century the site had become a nine hole golf course bordered by villas. This area was acquired under the will of John Ainslie in 1921 and became the site of the new Astley Ainslie Hospital in 1922. Most of the villas were retained and converted for hospital use, thus preserving the essential character of the earlier villa development. The distinctive butterfly-plan pavilions facing Blackford Hill were erected in the 1930s.

Twentieth and Twenty-first Centuries

The character of the Grange was well established by the end of the 19th century. No major changes took place in the Grange in the first half of the 20th century apart from some notable additions in the inter-war years and the controversial demolition of Grange House in 1936, to make way for a new development of bungalows and flatted villas. The gatepiers from Grange House, surmounted by the Lauder Wyverns, were re-erected on Grange Loan, one at the corner of Lover's Loan and the other seventy yards west of Lauder Road.

Since the Second World War, development has mainly occurred within the gardens of some of the larger villas, although a small number of villas have been demolished to make way for new developments. Notable examples of inter- and post-war architecture in the Grange have been recognised by listing, and contribute to its architectural quality, including the Strathearn Road Postal Sorting Office (1919); the

Astley Ainslie Scientific Block (1929); 40-42 and 46a Dick Place (1934); 14 Kilgraston Road (1937) and 10 St Thomas Rd (1961). More recently, a number of striking contemporary extensions have added further to the evolution of the area's architecture.

Historical activity

Although the Dick Lauder feuing conditions restricted non-residential uses in that part of the area, changes appeared over time, primarily introducing uses connected with health, social and community care such as nursing homes, schools/colleges, churches/community centres and a library. A certain amount of industrial activity also developed at the peripheries of the area during the 19th century, such as the William Younger & Co. Artesian Wells in Grange Loan. The evolution of the Astley Ainslie site is the only example of the development of non-residential activities on a large scale in the Grange area.

Summary

The development of the Grange reflected changes to the settlement pattern and suburban expansion which occurred in Edinburgh in the mid-19th century. While the rigorous terms and conditions of the historic feuing plans controlled the standards and scale of development in the Grange, the characteristic styles of its architecture and landscape features were fashioned more by picturesque influences which became popular during the Victorian era.

A large part of the Grange was developed around 1830, when such ideas were being adopted by the growing middle class of merchants and professionals in Edinburgh who were seeking a more secluded environment in which to raise their families. The Grange had the advantages of physical separation from the overcrowded medieval city core and offered individual dwellings in a predominantly suburban setting in contrast to the tenements of the Georgian New Town. Detached or semi-detached houses within their own private gardens bounded by high stone walls provided an attractive contrast to the communal living of the central area, and the fashions and desires of property owners are reflected in the profusion of architectural styles and individual or idiosyncratic features. The outstanding quality of many of the villas is due to the insistence of the Dick Lauder family on high architectural standards. The suburb, virtually complete by 1890, represented the idealisation of country living within an urban setting.

4. Special Characteristics

4.1 Structure

- Gently sloping, south facing land
- Hierarchical grid street pattern with clearly defined blocks
- Strict formality relieved by curves and other variations
- Formal and picturesque composition
- Layout creates inward-looking, short-range and glimpse views
- Low density, rhythmic pattern of precisely sited buildings
- Gaps between buildings create space and glimpses of gardens
- Astley Ainslie Hospital and Grange Cemetery form principal public open spaces
- Boundary walls enhance formal definition between public and private

Topography

The Grange Conservation Area is situated approximately one mile to the south of Edinburgh city centre on gently sloping south facing land. The slope declines gently from an upper ridge on which Grange and Strathearn Roads are built, one of a series of glacial drumlins extending east-west from Arthur's Seat.

Setting

The conservation area is bounded by residential areas and local town centres of contrasting character on all sides: Bruntsfield, Marchmont and Sciennes to the north; Causewayside and Newington to the east; Blackford and the south suburban railway line to the south and Morningside and Churchhill to the west. The protected open spaces of Blackford Hill, Braid Hills and the Craigmillar Park Golf Course to the south provide a welcome visual contrast and amenity area.

Views

View cones defined by the Council's Skyline Study cross the Grange area although none originate within it. These include views of the city's core landmarks from the Braid Hills, Blackford Hill, Buckstone Snab and Liberton; and the reverse southward views from the Castle Esplanade. Prominent development within the Grange would therefore potentially impact in the fore- and middle ground of several key views.

Within the Grange, tall garden walls, mature trees and relatively flat topography give much of the area an inward-looking character with few longer-range views available. The exceptions are the southward vistas along Kilgraston Road, Whitehouse Loan and Blackford Avenue allowing views of the Braid and Blackford Hills. Restricted views of Arthur's Seat are also available from the north-east corner of the conservation area. Mid- and short-range views are important, framed by the grid street pattern and formal building siting. Glimpse views through the gaps between detached buildings enhance the picturesque qualities of the townscape.

Development pattern

The plan form of the Grange is the product of regulation by consecutive feuing plans which dictated the street layout, buildings, gardens, boundaries and public spaces. The intersecting street pattern is simple and uncluttered. This incorporates the classical grid pattern of Dick Lauder and Cousin's less rigid layout, and exploits the natural topography and south facing aspect.

The few areas which contrast significantly with this prevailing pattern occur principally in the areas of open space, towards the south and at the edges of the development where variations have been incorporated to provide terraced dwellings, shops and services.

Grain and density

The density of development is generally very low. Dwellings on many corner sites in the Grange are sited to take advantage of the southern aspect. Houses on the north side of the street are generally situated to maximise front gardens, whereas most properties on the south side have larger rear gardens. Building line and separation are therefore of key importance.

The separation of dwellings creates a characteristic rhythm and solid-void repetition between precisely-sited structures of similar scale and massing. The spacious gardens provide an important setting for the buildings and mature trees within. The gaps between buildings are important in maintaining the dominant green character, a sense of generous space, and glimpse views of rear and side gardens.

Streets

The feuing plans allowed for streets of generous proportions, with relative widths reflecting the principal and secondary routes through the development. The intersecting street pattern forms a series of clearly defined blocks. Possibly the oldest route across the area, Lovers' Loan, is preserved as a pedestrian path.

Spaces

The majority of open space in the Grange is in private gardens. There are no major areas of public open space. However, Astley Ainslie Hospital, Grange Cemetery and the Carlton Cricket Ground provide welcome, open green spaces which contribute to the landscape character of the conservation area. The special characteristics of the Astley Ainslie Hospital are described at section 4.3.

Grange Cemetery retains its original sense of peace and seclusion, providing the amenity of a pleasant, formally-planned open space with lawns, flowers and mature trees. The cemetery contains a large number of fine Victorian ornamental headstones.

Situated at the corner of Grange Loan and Lover's Loan, the Carlton Cricket Ground is the other main expansive green area which contributes to the amenity and spacious nature of the Grange.

4.2 Key elements

- Two storey detached and semi-detached dwellings, precisely sited
- Prominent churches act as landmarks
- Generous scale and fine proportions
- Dominant architectural symmetry and verticality
- High quality sandstone ashlar and natural slate
- High rubble boundary walls, railings and hedges
- Quiet seclusion
- Public services integrated into boundary walls
- Generous private gardens and mature trees create green character

Scale

Feuing requirements restricted the height of development to two storeys and an attic. Detached and semi-detached dwellings predominate. A significant proportion have been subdivided to form flats but generally retain the original footprint and height. Tall boundary walls, or in some areas railings and hedges, give a distinctive sense of scale and enclosure to the public street.

Building types and styles

Property owners were given a degree of freedom in the design of individual properties, resulting in a diversity of architectural styles. Revivalist styles such as Scots Baronial, Jacobean Gothic and Italianate Classical feature prominently. Formal and picturesque dwellings of generous scale and fine proportions, precisely sited in generous feus, became the prevailing pattern. There is a clear dominance of symmetry in the composition of front elevations, as well as a strong preference for the vertical over the horizontal, created by repeating features of bays, dormers, turrets and chimneys.

Changes in housing demand towards the end of the 19th century and into the 20th created a greater variety of dwelling types, mainly at the edges of the estate. Detached dwellings become less prevalent south of Grange Loan, with greater numbers of terraced and semi-detached villas. Mid-20th century infill and replacements of earlier villas also created variety, particularly west of Blackford Avenue, with larger-footprint apartment blocks more common here.

The International Modern style was introduced to Edinburgh in the Grange with Kininmonth and Spence's 46a Dick Place of 1933. 10 St Thomas Rd by Morris & Steedman of 1961 is an important post-war contribution to the architectural quality of the area.

Landmarks

Although the Grange is primarily a residential area with few public buildings, the presence of a number of churches occupying prominent locations, mostly at or near

cross-roads, contributes to the townscape character and views into and out of the conservation area.

Marchmont St. Giles (1871), originally the Robertson Memorial Church, is the most prominent single building in the Grange due to its situation in an isolated position on rising ground in Kilgraston Road at the west end of the Grange Cemetery. The c.50m spire is visible from many points across the city.

Materials and details

A significant level of uniformity is achieved from the use of local building materials, despite the considerable range of building styles. The predominant materials are local grey sandstone in ashlar or coursed rubble for buildings and garden walls, with hand carved decoration; natural slate, often Scots slate, for roofs; and timber framed sash and case windows with plate glass.

Trees and gardens

Private gardens dominate the landscape character of the Grange. The area contains approximately 10,000 trees of more than 120 species and its uniformity is largely dependent on this profusion of mature trees. They are valuable for their appearance and environmental benefits, such as dampening noise and providing shelter for houses and gardens against wind and frost, 'green lungs' for surrounding, less wooded areas and habitats for wildlife. Large trees are of particular importance as they partially obscure dwellings from public view.

Many of the existing trees in the Grange were planted as part of the original villa development, and the majority of the trees are over one hundred years old. Significant growth of mature trees has also happened since the end of the Second World War, once gardens were no longer needed for intensive food cultivation to support the war effort. Over 90% of trees are located in individual private gardens although there is a row of street trees which formed part of the original boundary of the estate in Sciennes Road; nine mature trees (sycamores, horse chestnuts and a lime) in Glenisla Gardens, and a few other isolated examples.

Streetscape

The dimensions and finish of footpaths were specified in the original feuing conditions. Very little Caithness stone paving remains, although many of the original granite kerbs still exist. Hope Terrace is one of the few streets in the Grange which retains its original setted surface. No historic street furniture is believed to survive, although modern street lighting heights reflect the historic hierarchy of circulation.

The typical, high stone walls of the Grange add to its sense of visual and physical seclusion, and reflect the romantic ideal of country estate living. The geometric pattern of walls of mainly uniform height gives definition to the street layout and an air of formality by making a clear distinction between public and private spaces. The robustness, continuity and quality of detailing of these boundary treatments, such as gatepiers, ironwork and dressed copings, provide the public face of the more secluded, private architecture behind. Variations in boundary type, design and

material, the visual permeability of railings, gates and planting, and regular punctuation with pedestrian gates reduces the 'barrier' effect by allowing glimpse views.

Public services have been set into boundary walls wherever possible. Electricity equipment boxes as well as traditional red post boxes are tidily recessed into the masonry walls. This gives the streets of the Grange a distinctive uncluttered and spacious appearance.

Two further elements of the historic Grange House survive in Grange Loan and add interest to the streetscape; the Wyverns which decorated the gatepiers of the house, now moved from their original locations; and the remains of the Penny Well (capped in the 1940s but retaining an inscribed plaque).

Activity

Uses other than residential were specifically prohibited in the original feuing conditions, and in the majority of the Grange the quiet, secluded character intended by these stipulations remains the case. However, residential uses have been gradually appended with a variety of local services and businesses, mostly focused at the edges of the area adjacent to the local commercial centres of Marchmont, Causewayside and Morningside. A number of large former villas have been converted to various institutional and commercial uses.

Population density in the Grange gradually increased during the 20th century as properties were subdivided, villas replaced with flatted developments and plots subdivided to create infill development. Demand for development of multi-occupancy blocks has continued in some areas. However population growth appears to have slowed in recent years and there may be some evidence of a reversal of the earlier trends, with subdivided houses being returned to single-family use and some infill plots being developed as single houses. Home working and a trend for extension rather than re-location has also created demand for adapted and extended residential properties.

Vehicular traffic has of course become increasingly dominant through the 20th and 21st centuries and both passive and active traffic management measures have been introduced throughout the area. Pedestrian and cycle permeability of the area is excellent, including Lovers' Loan, part of the Core Paths network, and Astley Ainslie, popular as an attractive short-cut.

4.3 Astley Ainslie Hospital

The Astley Ainslie Hospital site contrasts with the majority of the Grange in both use and character, being a large, open, publicly-accessible site in health/educational use with a significant element of 20th century architecture.

- Secluded site enclosed by boundary walls and formal gates
- Attractive, landscaped open space with significant mature tree cover
- Early villa and garden layout provides structure for later insertions
- Notable early 20th century healthcare buildings sit comfortably in the landscape
- High quality architecture of two contrasting types, C19th villas and C20th pavilions

Topography, setting and views

The site is relatively level with a slight slope downwards from north to south. The site is relatively secluded behind high boundary walls and planting. However, the summit and northern slopes of Blackford Hill and the Royal Observatory building are extensively in view from the site. Conversely, the site occupies a major part of the foreground of important views from Blackford Hill across the Grange and towards the city centre skyline.

Development pattern, grain and density

Evidence of the strong north-south plot divisions of the 1803 estate feuing plan remain in the current layout, with villas at Canaan House, Canaan Park, St Roque and Morelands remaining in situ. Some of their ancillary structures such as lodges, garden walls and garden sculpture survive to define the historic grain. The line of Canaan Lane also appears to have been defined by the 1803 feuing layout.

The green structure of the site consists of perimeter tree belts, internal belts enclosing separate villas and individual specimens, all of which again reflect the historic layout, even where individuals are of later origin. The main exception is the large coniferous plantation at the south side of the site. The whole site except this plantation is protected by a Tree Preservation Order.

Later development, most significantly the 1930s insertions by Auldjo, Jamieson and Arnott, although contrasting in footprint and style, generally fit comfortably within and preserve the earlier landscape structure.

Scale

The 19th century villas are mainly of 2 to 3 storeys on a compact footprint. The 20th century pavilions spread out further into the parkland setting with extended 'butterfly' plans over one or two storeys. However the generous scale of the overall site ensures that even the larger structures do not dominate their landscape setting.

Building types, materials and details

The character of the 19th century villa development largely reflects that of the main body of the Grange (see sections 4.1 and 4.2). However, alterations and additions reflect their later adaptation for health care use, including evidence of shelters for outdoor recuperation at Canaan Park.

The 1930s development, beginning with the Millbank Pavilion and a series of similar butterfly pavilions, reflects the designers' intention to provide therapeutic spaces for tuberculosis sufferers, requiring access to fresh air, light and the outdoor environment. These buildings follow a general pattern of symmetrical planning with stripped classical detailing. The horizontal emphasis of deep roofs, eaves and broad dormers is counteracted by the vertical rhythm of pilasters and chimneys. Materials generally consist of harled walls, artificial stone detailing and tiled roofs.

The entrance gates at Whitehouse Loan and Canaan Lane provide important focal points. Although contemporary with the 1930s butterfly pavilions, these outward-facing features are more historicist in style, emulating Georgian architecture.

5. Management

5.1 Legislation, policies and guidance

Conservation areas

The Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 states that conservation areas "are areas of special architectural or historic interest, the character or appearance of which it is desirable to preserve or enhance". Local authorities have a statutory duty to identify and designate such areas.

Special attention must be paid to the character and appearance of the conservation area when planning controls are being exercised in a conservation area. Unlisted buildings require conservation area consent for demolition. Fewer types of development benefit from permitted development rights than outwith conservation areas. Proposed works to trees require notification to the Council.

Listed buildings

A significant proportion of buildings within the Grange are listed for their special architectural or historic interest and are protected under the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997. Listed building consent is required for the demolition of a listed building, or its alteration or extension in any manner which would affect its special character.

National policy

The Scottish Historic Environment Policy (SHEP) is the strategic statement of national policy relating to the historic environment.

The development plan

The Edinburgh City Local Plan sets out policies and proposals for the development and use of land in the City. The policies in the Plan are used to determine applications for development. In broad summary, the key policy areas affecting the Grange Conservation Area are:

- Design of new development DES 1, 3, 5, 11, 12
- Listed buildings ENV 2-4
- Conservation areas ENV 5-6
- Historic gardens and designed landscapes ENV 7
- Archaeology ENV 8-9
- Trees ENV 12
- Natural heritage and nature conservation ENV 10-16 [\[insert links\]](#)

The proposed City of Edinburgh Local Development Plan (LDP) contains broadly similar policies and is a material consideration in current planning decisions.

Planning guidance

More detailed, subject-specific guidance is set out in Planning Guidance documents. Those particularly relevant to the Grange Conservation Area are:

- [Guidance for Householders](#)
- [Guidance for Businesses](#)
- [Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas](#)
- [Developer contributions and affordable housing](#)
- [Edinburgh Design guidance](#)
- [Communications Infrastructure](#)
- Street Design Guidance - *draft to be published in 2014*
- Trees and Development [\[link\]](#)
- Gardens and Designed Landscapes [\[link\]](#)
- Guidance on Biodiversity [\[link\]](#)

In addition, a number of statutory tools are available to assist development management within the conservation area:

GPDO and Article 4 Directions

The Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (Scotland) Order 1992, amended 2012, (abbreviated to GPDO), restricts the types of development which can be carried out in a conservation area without the need for planning permission. These include most alterations to the external appearance of dwellinghouses and flats. Development is not precluded, but such alterations will require planning permission and special attention will be paid to the potential effect of proposals.

Under Article 4 of the GPDO the planning authority can seek the approval of the Scottish Ministers for Directions that restrict development rights further. The Directions effectively control the proliferation of relatively minor developments in conservation areas which can cumulatively lead to the erosion of character and appearance. The Grange Conservation Area has Article 4 Directions covering the following classes of development:

- 7 The erection, construction, maintenance, improvement or alteration of a gate, fence, wall or other means of enclosure;
- 38 Development by statutory undertakers for the purpose of water undertakings;
- 39 Development by public gas supplier;
- 40 Development by electricity statutory undertaker;
- 41 Tramway or road transport undertakings

Trees

Trees within conservation areas are covered by the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997. This Act applies to the uprooting, felling or lopping of a tree having a diameter exceeding 75mm at a point 1.5m above ground level, and concerns the lopping of trees as much as removal. The planning authority must be given six weeks notice of the intention to uproot, fell or lop trees. Failure to give notice will render the person liable to the same penalties as for contravention of a Tree Preservation Order (TPO).

TPOs are used to secure the preservation of trees which are of significant stature, in sound condition, and prominently located to be of amenity value to the public at large. When assessing contribution to amenity, the importance of trees as wildlife habitats will be taken into consideration. There is a strong presumption against any form of development or change of use of land which is likely to damage or prejudice the future long term existence of trees covered by a TPO. The removal of trees for arboricultural reasons will not imply that the space created by their removal can be used for development.

TPOs in the Grange [\[map link\]](#)

Heritage Trees in the Grange [\[map link\]](#)

Landscape and Biodiversity

The Council has an obligation to take account of the impact of development on species protected by legislation and international commitments. The Nature Conservation (Scotland) Act 2004 places a duty on all public bodies to further the conservation of biodiversity as far as is consistent with their functions. The conservation area contains no nature conservation designations but its rich garden landscape and open spaces at Grange Cemetery and Astley Ainslie give it a high amenity and biodiversity value. The area is bounded to the south by the Blackford Hill/Braid Hills/Craigmillar Park Golf Course area which is protected by a range of local and national landscape and natural heritage designations including an area of great landscape value, local nature reserve, areas of ancient woodland, and a site of special scientific interest (SSSI). [\[map links\]](#)

The Grange Conservation Area contains no landscapes included in the national Inventory of Gardens and Designed Landscapes. [\[link\]](#)

Archaeology

The conservation area contains no scheduled monuments of national significance, the nearest being the Blackford Hill fort and settlement to the south. The Astley Ainslie site contains an area of archaeological potential based around the site of the medieval chapel and plague burial ground of St Roque.

5.2 Pressures and sensitivities

The following pressures are associated with development proposals which conservation area designation, together with the statutory and non-statutory policies of the Council, are designed to manage.

Architectural unity

While the original feuing plans of the area contained a wide variety of architectural details and styles, often influenced by contemporary fashionable architects, there was an architectural unity which resulted from the strict feuing conditions and the consistent use of similar materials. Prior to conservation area designation, the architectural unity of the Grange was eroded in places by inappropriately scaled, flatted developments using poor quality materials.

Despite making the most significant contribution to the character of the conservation area, detached and semi-detached houses in the Grange make up less than 25% of the total number. There may be continuing pressure for the demolition of certain villas and redevelopment of the grounds for purpose-built flats, and the development of empty feus or parcels of garden land. Concern has been raised regarding the use of contrasting, non-traditional materials and design in contemporary new-build and extensions.

Recommendation: The unity and quality of the architecture of the Grange creates a need for a sensitivity of approach to any intervention. The Edinburgh Design Guidance advises that both traditional and contemporary approaches to design and materials may be considered acceptable in a conservation area, providing the result is of appropriate quality. The scale, mass and form of an intervention are usually greater factors in its success or failure to respect the character of the area than details of style or material. Design of interventions should be based on a sound understanding of context.

Development of villa grounds

A major pressure is on the setting of villas, garden space and boundary walls and the loss of mature trees through extensions to existing property and the erection of new developments within villa grounds.

Key elements of the area's special characteristics are potentially at risk through such development, such as the separation/distinction between buildings and the important gaps between them. This type of development may also risk the creation of uncharacteristic expanses of hard-landscaping, loss of green landscaping and trees.

Recommendation: Townscape gaps, glimpse views of gardens and the characteristic separation of buildings should be carefully considered in proposals for side extension or development of garden areas to avoid amalgamation of plots or the creation of a terraced effect where this is not the distinctive character.

Boundary treatments

The historic boundary treatments of the area contribute to a sense of privacy and seclusion that remains sought-after in modern development. However, the use of long expanses of completely opaque boundaries and gates can alienate properties from the street and create a fortified, unwelcoming character. Historic boundaries tend to retain a degree of visual permeability through the use of railings, gates or planting or through intermittent, relatively narrow openings such as pedestrian gates and secure viewing panels.

Recommendation: Where alterations to existing boundaries or the creation of new boundaries are being considered, a balance should be retained between the strong character of solid boundaries creating privacy, and the visual relief provided by limited openings and variations in treatment.

Conversely, traditional boundaries no longer exist in some areas, particularly in relation to 20th century multi-occupancy residential or commercial buildings which require larger vehicle openings and expanses of hard landscaping for car parking or communal facilities. The traditional divisions between public and private, and the quality of the buildings' setting, have been eroded in these areas.

Recommendation: These sites would benefit from the introduction or reinstatement of narrower openings and more formal boundaries which would help to define both the public street edge and the private grounds. Signage in relation to access to and management of multi-occupancy sites also requires sensitive design.

Loss of mature trees

Several factors have led to the reduction of mature trees in the Grange. While a significant percentage of trees was lost during the outbreak of Dutch Elm disease, others have been removed to facilitate parking or extensions, or have been subjected to lopping. Not only does lopping produce poor aesthetic results, especially in winter when there is no foliage to disguise the form, but the tree is left exposed to invasion by disease and rot. There has also been a tendency to plant small trees, such as cherries, rowans and crab apples, which fail to provide the appropriate scale, shelter and natural habitat of the larger species.

Recommendations: Proper management of trees requires collaboration between the planning authority and owners if the most important specimens of various species are to be preserved. The gradual renewal of trees should be designed to preserve scale and variety. Proposals to plant, cut back or remove trees must be considered for the impact on the overall appearance of the Grange, to ensure that the fine townscape of the original feuing plans is preserved. It is also important to consider the whole environment of shade, protection from the elements and noise reduction. Above all, the character of trees in the Grange, i.e. freely growing and fully expressive of their individuality, should not be compromised.

The following measures could assist this process:

- *appropriate planting should be encouraged in areas which have lost a substantial number of large trees, particularly on corner sites where large trees could easily be accommodated;*
- *tree thinning should be promoted as an alternative to lopping in order to preserve the character and outline of the tree;*
- *if large trees cannot be salvaged without unacceptable loss of form and character, they should only be replaced with similar species;*
- *replacement trees should be selected to form strong, but unobtrusive settings for individual houses and contribute to an integrating framework for the whole area; and*
- *framework trees should be broad-leaved, long lived, hardy, and interesting in form. They should be in scale with and provide a setting for the buildings.*

5.3 Opportunities for development

Small-scale development opportunities for infill or replacement may arise, and the issues connected with these are discussed above. The only major opportunity site likely to arise within the conservation area is the Astley Ainslie Hospital. The site's owners, Lothian Primary Care NHS Trust, may develop plans to re-organise or relocate hospital facilities within or outwith the site. Development here has the potential to significantly affect the character of the site itself and that of the wider area. The Council has produced a Planning Brief addressing the key considerations for the site [\[link\]](#).

5.4 Opportunities for planning action

Conservation area boundaries: the boundaries have been examined through the appraisal process. They are considered to encapsulate the special character of the Grange and no changes are proposed at present. A future review of the Causewayside and Morningside Road areas may result in recommendations for amendments to adjoining conservation area boundaries which may in turn affect the Grange boundary. However this would be addressed in the justification for any proposed changes to those areas adjoining the Grange.

5.5 Opportunities for enhancement

Sciennes Road – the strip of open space with mature trees and shrubs on the south side of the road, opposite the Royal Hospital for Sick Children and Sciennes Primary School, would benefit from enhanced landscaping and planting, and repairs or improvements to its boundary fencing. Its potential as an area of accessible amenity space should be investigated.

Grange Cemetery – a number of containers and portakabins detract from the special character of the cemetery. The area would benefit from the development of a more sensitive solution for storage and management of cemetery maintenance.

DRAFT

6. Sources

Print

Cant, Malcolm, *Marchmont, Sciennes and the Grange*, Malcolm Cant Publications, 2001

Gifford, McWilliam & Walker, *The Buildings of Scotland: Edinburgh*, Penguin, 1984

Grange Association, *The Grange, A Case for Conservation*, 1982

Harris, Stuart, *The Place Names of Edinburgh*, Steve Savage, 2002

Smith, Charles J., *Historic South Edinburgh (Volume 1)*, Charles Skilton Ltd, 2000

Web

PAN 71, Conservation Area Management [\[link\]](#)

Edinburgh Skyline Study [\[link\]](#)

Scottish Neighbourhood Statistics www.sns.gov.uk

The Grange Association <http://gaedin.co.uk/wp/>